Tanzania anti-bribery intervention
Project background

- **Objective**: reduce (opportunities) for corruption in public health facilities in Dar es Salaam - discourage bribery
- Test whether it is possible to address social norms of corruption
- Test the effectiveness of working through social networks

- **Preliminary work**
  - Unexpected results
  - Zoom into the identified behaviour
  - Engage key stakeholders (MAT)
  - Test messages
  - Test intervention approaches
  - Test data collection tools
Intervention - components

Premise: To change social norms around gift giving and to ultimately change behaviour, we need to
1. Address (some of) the underlying motivations for gift-giving;
2. Target both patients and facility staff.

Champions
- Peer-intervention - staff at participating departments/wards
- Trained during ‘champions workshop’
- Tasked with dissemination of core anti-gift giving message

Provider-facing messages
- Desk signs with anti-gift giving messages (already refined with feedback from providers and MAT)
- Direct messages to providers - SMS? Letters?

Patient-facing messages
- Posters in facilities with anti-gift giving messages
- Desk signs with anti-gift giving messages
Intervention materials

TUSAI DIZE KUZINGATIA TAALUMA USITOE ZAWADI,
HATA KAMA NI KUONYESHA SHUKRANI!

TAFADHALI TUSAI DIZE KUZINGATIA
TAALUMA KATIKA HOSPITAL YA RUFAA
MWANANYAMALA
USITOE ZAWADI.

Wizara ya afya inachukulia zawadi
kutoka kwa wagonjwa kwenda kwa
wafanyakazi wa kituo hiki kama moja
ya vichocheo vya rushwa

KUKUBALI ZAWADI KUTOKA KWA WAGONJWA WI MJONGONI
MWA VICOCHOEO VYA RUSHWA. THAMINI MAADILI NA
TARATIBU ZA TAALUMA, KATAA ZAWADI YOYOTE.

Kama mgonjwa atakupa zawadi, fuata hatua hizi nne rahisi:
1. Mshukuru mgonjwa kwa kuthamini kazi yako
2. Mwambie kwamba huwezi kupokea zawadi zake
3. Mfakanuiele kwamba utajiweka kwenywe matatizo kama
   utapokea zawadi zake
4. Kama aksisitiza pendeka achinge kitu kwenywe hisani
   kuonyesha shukrani yake.

Hajaliishi zawadi inatolewa kabla au baada ya
huduma! Kama ni fedha au kitu kingine! Hajaliishi
inatolewa kama asante au kwa ajili ya kupata kitu
Watoe huduma wanapokea zawadi wanajweka
kwenywe hutani ya kupata matokeo.

Ahsanto
Hapana
23 November 2021: Champions workshop
Working to address social norms

Tackling descriptive and inductive norms

• Measurement with vignettes

• Imagine someone called Mary. Mary had a severe health problem and received treatment at this hospital. She has recovered well and therefore decides to give the provider a gift to say thank you for the good treatment she received.
Network component

How often do you talk to these people during a regular week?

- Jan
- Addy
- Morgan
- Never
- Sometimes
- Moderately often
- Very often
- Extremely often
- Sibie
- Pablo
- Eugene
- Finn
- Rachel
- Marcel

How often have you talked to these people about gift giving since the start of the intervention?

- Amina
- Julie
- Rachel
- Never
- Once or twice
- Multiple times
- Jon
- Sibie
- Morgan
- Finn
- Addy
Preliminary results: Large and statistically significant reductions in survey-based measures

Primary outcome
Gift-giving propensity score
Reported gift-giving during visit and intention to give gift in future

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Went down</th>
<th>23% → 13%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Secondary outcome 1
Enabling norms score
8 items measuring perceptions of social norms that enable gift-giving

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Went down</th>
<th>46% → 40%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| • Would consider giving a gift in future: 43% → 25% |
| • Said they gave a gift during their visit: 2.8% → 0.7% |

Secondary outcome 2
Enabling attitudes score
3 items measuring personal attitudes that enable gift-giving

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Went down</th>
<th>56% → 44%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| • Believes most other users give gifts to say thank you: 31% → 28% |
| • Believes users who give gifts get better service in future: 50% → 43% |
| • Reports that giving a gift to say thanks is the right thing to do: 77% → 65% |
| • Believes a doctor is socially obliged to accept a gift: 60% → 47% |
The Team

- University of Dar es Salaam
  - Richard Sambaiga
  - Veronica Alexander Mkoji
  - Ibrahim Kisinza
- The Behavioural Insights Team
  - Ruth Persian
  - Violette Gadenne
  - Dilhan Perera
- University of Utrecht
  - Tobias Stark